House Concurrent Resolution 50 of the 2018 Regular Legislative Session

Summary of Findings

Prepared by:

Louisiana Violent Death Reporting System (LA-VDRS) Program

Louisiana Department of Health Office of Public Health Bureau of Family Health



Contents

cecutive Summary	2
,	
ection 1 – Overview of National Violent Death Reporting System (NVDRS)	4
Subsection 1.2 – Committee members	5
Subsection 1.3 – Proceedings	5
ection 2 – Data Collection Process	6
Subsection 2.1– Committee Findings	6
Subsection 2.2 – Data Collection Templates	<u>7</u>
Subsection 2.3 – Attachment	<u>8</u>

Executive Summary

Violence is a public health concern negatively affecting Louisiana's residents, communities and economy. In the 2018 Legislative session, Representative Edward "Ted" James proposed House Bill 458 to facilitate the sharing of information on violent deaths between law enforcement and coroner agencies and the Louisiana Department of Health's (LDH) federally funded National Violent Death Reporting System (NVDRS) initiative sponsored by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). The legislation was intended to serve as a single piece of legislation that would give law enforcement agencies and coroners' offices legislative protections to share case level investigative information with the Office of Public Health. It had been suggested by attorneys representing law enforcement that one clear piece of legislation would protect them from sharing with public health which was not an exemption under the public records legislation. The bill further delineated the protections that legislatively exist to protect information shared with the Office of Public Health in its course of investigations. i.e., Louisiana Revised Statute 40:3.1. House Bill 458 received opposition from the Louisiana's Coroner's Association, Sheriff's Association, the District Attorney's Association, and the Louisiana State Police. The bill sponsor decided to withdraw the bill and create a mechanism to further study a solution for data collection for NVDRS. House Concurrent Resolution (HCR) 50 was the resulting urge and request for LDH and the stakeholder organizations to identify a means to enable the collection of comprehensive information on violent death cases, defined as suicides, homicides, deaths of undetermined natures, deaths due to legal intervention, unintentional firearm death, or death due to terrorism.

This report is a compilation of the study committee's proceedings and identified solution. It outlines participating organizations, the approach to reaching consensus, meeting agendas and discussion notes and decisions, data collection process, and summary templates for collection of required data.

The main findings from the study subcommittee include:

- Legislation (LA RS 40:3.1) exists that protects information provided to the Office of Public Health in the course of investigations
- Public records laws (LA RS 44:4.1) do not include specific exemptions for public health. Law enforcement agencies would only be comfortable sharing the required information to public health with approval from the prosecuting district attorney of the relevant jurisdiction.
- When discussing an amendment to LA RS 44:4.1, there was lack of agreement of the members on the necessity for, or the potential success of, any future proposed legislation to solve this issue.
- In order to best report, understand and characterize violent deaths, the Study Committee recognizes the need for standardized data collection tools. The committee also recommends that any such tool must be designed as to not create undue burden on the participating agencies as well as assurances for confidentiality for data.
- The most appropriate next step would be legislation, but in the absence of legislation that mandated sharing of investigative information, agencies should voluntarily decide to participate and identify and agree upon the extent of data they would provide.

• Agencies could be encouraged to participate by the professional Associations – Louisiana District Attorneys Association, Louisiana Coroners Association, District Judges Association, Louisiana Sheriff's Association, and the Louisiana Association of Chief of Police.

Section 1 - Overview of National Violent Death Reporting System (NVDRS)

Violence is a public health concern negatively affecting Louisiana's residents, communities and economy. In the 2018 Regular Legislative Session, Representative Edward "Ted" James proposed House Bill 458 to facilitate the sharing of information on violent deaths between law enforcement and coroner agencies and the Louisiana Department of Health's (LDH) federally-funded National Violent Death Reporting System (NVDRS) initiative sponsored by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). The legislation was intended to serve as a single piece of legislation that would give law enforcement agencies and coroners' offices legislative protections to share case level investigative information with the Office of Public Health.

House Concurrent Resolution (HCR) 50 was the final result of House Bill 458 which urged and requested the Louisiana Department of Health and the designated organizations to identify a means to enable the collection of comprehensive information on violent death cases, defined as suicides, homicides, deaths of undetermined intent or manner, deaths due to legal intervention, unintentional firearm death, or death due to terrorism.

Louisiana participates in the NVDRS which collects *the who, what, when, where,* and *how* to help understand the *why* behind violent deaths. It is the only state-based active surveillance (reporting) system that merges and standardizes data from vital records, coroners and law enforcement on violent deaths into one comprehensive usable, anonymous, web-based database. At the time of the proposed legislation, Louisiana was one of 42 states participating in the national reporting system. Shortly thereafter, the US Congress appropriated funding for all 50 states and US territories to participate in the NVDRS. As of October 1, 2018, NVDRS is a national comprehensive, systematized, standardized surveillance system for violent death.

The NVDRS dataset is the nation's one stop source of information on suicides, homicides, unintentional fatal shootings, and law enforcement related fatalities. The data give a clearer picture of violent death and act as a tool to detect trends, and evaluate which policies, programs and strategies have the most impact. Providing these analyses to partners allows them to understand trends in their community and to concentrate their resources where most needed. In addition, with accurate and timely NVDRS data, the state can appropriately describe the problem of violence on communities and impact the targeting and success of prevention activities.

Subsection 1.1 - Purpose of the Committee

The purpose of the HCR 50 study committee was to "identify means by which to enable the collection of comprehensive information, prepared and compiled with the death of an individual who suffered a violent death." The Louisiana Department of Health (LDH) was to "engage, collaborate with, and obtain information from designated organizations and additional parties with appropriate expertise to provide guidance on this matter. LDH convened a study group as directed and is required to submit a summary of committee findings outlining the identified procedure or mechanism for sharing information between the Office of Public Health (OPH) and coroners and law enforcement agencies, and any others in the connection with the death of an individual who has suffered a violent death.

Subsection 1.2 – Committee members

HCR 50 outlined a list of designated organizations and included a provision that allowed for the engagement, and collaboration with and obtaining information from "stakeholder groups or additional parties with appropriate expertise to provide guidance on this matter."

HCR 50 stipulated inclusion of the following individuals or designated agency representatives:

- Louisiana State Police (Superintendent or designee)
- Louisiana Association of Chiefs of Police (President or designee)
- Louisiana Sheriff's Association (Executive Director or designee)
- Louisiana District Attorney's Association (Executive Director or designee)
- Louisiana District Judges Association (President or designee)
- Louisiana Supreme Court (Chief Justice or designee)
- Baton Rouge Police Department (Chief or designee)
- East Baton Rouge District Attorney (or designee)
- Louisiana State Coroners' Association (President or designee)
- Louisiana Department of Health (Deputy Secretary or designee)
- Louisiana Office of Public Health (Assistant Secretary or designee)

Additional organizations currently participating in the NVDRS project are the Calcasieu Parish Sheriff's Office, the Jefferson Parish Sheriff's Office, East Baton Rouge Sheriff's Office, the New Orleans Police Department, and the Jefferson and Orleans Parishes Coroners' offices.

Subsection 1.3 – Proceedings

The committee convened twice on August 6, 2018 and September 13, 2018. Meetings were held at LDH Bienville Building.

Section 2 – Data Collection Process

Per NVDRS program guidelines, required data sources are to be secured by the grantee staff from the state Vital Records authority, law enforcement and coroners. The group discussed the types of data needed and mechanisms for obtaining the needed information. Data collection is the main responsibility of the Louisiana NVDRS staff. Participating agencies are only asked to submit known data variables. NVDRS does not require any investigation above and beyond that which is routinely performed by an investigating agency. Per protocol, by mid-month, Louisiana Vital Records provides electronic files from which all qualifying deaths can be extracted, de-identified and imported into the secure national data reporting system. The local Louisiana team then communicates with the responsible investigating law enforcement and coroners to officially request the needed information. The NVDRS supports data abstraction services and has trained data abstraction personnel who are available to assist law enforcement and coroner agency staff with data abstraction and data entry into the electronic system. If agencies prefer, they can abstract all known variables on one of the created templates and forward via a secure mechanism to the OPH NVDRS team.

NVDRS data request process:

- NVDRS team reaches out to agency via telephone to notify them of a case in need of data.
- NVDRS team provides an official request letter and template marked confidential. (See Attachment A)
- NVDRS team offers the services of data abstraction staff to come and abstract onsite.
- Agency forwards requested information to the NVDRS team or the NVDRS team goes on location and directly abstracts information and enters into the anonymized system.
- Agencies are asked if they require a memorandum of understanding with OPH. Should one be needed, the MOU is written up and shared with the agency for review and revisions if needed prior to the signing and provision of data.
- All hard copy records forwarded to OPH only include an identification number and no other protected information. All templates are marked confidential and are only used by the approved Louisiana NVDRS data abstraction staff. All hard copies are maintained in a locked filing cabinet within the offices of OPH Bureau of Family Health (BFH) in the Benson Tower in New Orleans.
- All participating agencies are invited to participate on the NVDRS State Advisory Body.
- Requests for aggregate data will be provided to stakeholders. NVDRS staff will not identify agencies responsible for investigations, however, an individual agency may request its own information and can approve the sharing of its agency data with others on a case-by-case basis.
- NVDRS staff will track data requests and maintain signed approvals for use of any agency specific data.

Subsection 2.1– Committee Findings

The committee proposed templates for law enforcement and coroner agencies. The templates include the main data variables collected by the NVDRS. Per committee discussion, the comprehensive list of required variables was pared down to 1) decrease burden for the collecting agency and 2) to exclude firearm questions that may make some providers suspicious of the motives of the national project.

Agencies are given the option of abstracting their own data onto the templates and forwarding to the NVDRS team or working with approved trained NVDRS Abstractors to collect the information.

The NVDRS team will work with the source agency to identify the least burdensome data collection option for the agency.

The main findings from the study subcommittee include:

- Legislation (LA RS 40:3.1) exists that protects information provided to the Office of Public Health in the course of investigations
- Public records laws (LA RS 44:4.1) do not include specific exemptions for public health. Law enforcement agencies would only be comfortable sharing the required information to public health with approval from the prosecuting district attorney of the relevant jurisdiction.
- When discussing an amendment to LA RS 44:4.1, there was lack of agreement of the members on the necessity for, or the potential success of, any future proposed legislation to solve this issue.
- In order to best report, understand and characterize violent deaths, the Study Committee recognizes the need for standardized data collection tools. The committee also recommends that any such tool must be designed as to not create undue burden on the participating agencies as well as assurances for confidentiality for data.
- The most appropriate next step would be legislation, but in the absence of legislation that mandated sharing of investigative information, agencies should voluntarily decide to participate and identify and agree upon the extent of data they would provide.
- Agencies could be encouraged to participate by the professional Associations Louisiana District Attorneys Association, Louisiana Coroners Association, District Judges Association, Louisiana Sheriff's Association, and the Louisiana Association of Chief of Police.

Subsection 2.2 – Data Collection Templates

Included as Attachment A.

Subsection 2.3 – Attachment

Attachment A: Data Abstraction Templates

Louisiana Department of Health 628 North Fourth Street, Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70802

> (225) 342-9500 www.ldh.la.gov



f www.facebook.com/LaHealthDept.



www.twitter.com/LADeptHealth

Attachment A: Data Collection Templates*

Coroner

Law Enforcement

*These templates look similar but include slightly different information.

CONFIDENTIAL: FOR OFFICE OF PUBLIC HEALTH USE ONLY

Victim Demographic Informatio	'n						
Last Name:	First Name:			Middle	Name:	D	ЭВ:
Gender: Transgender Sexua	al Orientatio	onRa	ace:		Hispanic/La		
Currently in a Relationship:							
Victim was homeless Current Occ	upation:		Ret	ired 🗌	Unemployed] Current/Fo	rmer Military
Injury and Death Information							
Injury Date: / Inju	ry Address:				Manner d	of Death:	
Injured at own home Injured w	hile in custo	ody EMS at	scene	Alcol	hol use suspected	d when injure	èd 🗌
Autopsy and Toxicology Inform Height (in inches): Weight (If Fe	emale, Preg	nancy	Status:		
Number of Penetrating Wounds i.e. kin Number of bullets that hit victim:		t (bullet entry count	ts as 1 wound	; bullet e	exit counts as anothe	r): Note: one shotgu	
		Head 🗖	Face 🗌	1		er Extremity [
Penetrating Wound Locations (check	if present):		Thorax			er Extremity	
Alcohol and Drug Testing (enter regardl Toxicology Tested - Yes No Date Specimens Collected:/	-		-	-	-	ol concentratio	n, BAC):
Substance Type	Tested	Positive	Su	bstan	ce Type	Tested	Positive
Alcohol			Barbiturate		<i>.</i>		
BAC (mg/dl):% Carbon Monoxide (CO) Source:			Benzodiaze	pines			
Amphetamines			Cocaine				
Anticonvulsants			Marijuana				
Antidepressants			Muscle Rela	ixants			
Antipsychotics			Opiates				
(List any additional substances on back of thi	s form)						
Circumstances – Complete the foll Mental Health and Substance Abuse	•	ALL MANNERS	OF DEATH	<u>I</u>	NOTE: each circui be explained in th	mstance checke	d should
Current depressed mood		rrent mental healt eatment	h		Other substance	problem/abu	se 🗆
Current mental health diagnosis(es)		er treated for men	tal health		Other addiction		
Please List:		substance abuse p cohol problem	oroblem		Please List:		- 🗆
		•					
Relationship Problems / Exposure to	Violence						
Intimate partner violence	Family rel	lationship problem		Abuse	e or neglect led to a	death	
Intimate partner problem		ationship problem			y of abuse or negle		
	other rele	actioniship problem		1.15001	, or abase of fregr		

Physical fight (2 people)		Previous perpetrator of violence in the past month
Argument Timing of Argument:		Previous victim of violence in the past month

Crime and Criminal Activity

Precipitated by another crime Crime(s) Type:	Prostitution or sex trafficking	
First crime in progress	Stalking	

Gang Related	
Walk-by assault	

Circumstances – Complete the following for HOMICIDE & LEGAL INTERVENTION Deaths only

Justifiable self defense	
Victim was a police officer on duty	
Victim was a bystander	
Random violence	

Mercy killing	
Hate crime	
Jealousy (lover's triangle)	
Brawl (3 people or more in a physical fight)	

Victim was an intervener	
Victim used a weapon	
Drive-by shooting	
Drug involvement	

Circumstances – Complete the following for **SUICIDE & UNDETERMINED** Deaths only

History of suicide attempts	
Disclosed suicidal thoughts or intent to commit suicide To whom:	
Left a suicide note	
Disaster exposure	

History of expressed suicidal	
thoughts or plans	
Contributing criminal legal	
problem	
Civil legal problems	
Anniversary of a traumatic event	
Suicide of friend or family	

Contributing physical health problem	
Job problem	
Financial problem	
School problem	
Eviction or loss of home	
Non-suicide death of friend/family	

Circumstances – Complete the following for UNINTENTIONAL/ACCIDENTAL FIREARM DEATHS only:

Hunting	
Self-defensive shooting	
Target Shooting	
Thought safety was engaged	

Playing with gun				
Loading or unloading gun				
Cleaning Gun				
Showing gun to others				

Gun defect or malfunction					
Thought gun was unloaded					
Unintentionally pulled trigger					
Other mechanism of injury					

Weapon Information

Primary Weapon Description (e.g. Knife, gun, hanging/rope, blunt instrument, poison, hands/fist)_____

For any death involving a <i>firearm</i> , enter the following :							
Number of <i>non-fatally</i> shot persons: Gun Owner/Relationship to victim:							
Gun stored loaded 🗌	Gun stored locked 🗌	Gun reported stolen 🗌					

Brief Narrative of the Incident

CONFIDENTIAL: FOR OFFICE OF PUBLIC HEALTH USE ONLY

Victim Demographic Informati	on			
Last Name:	_ First Name:		Middle	Name:DOB:
Gender: Transgender Sex	ual Orientation	Race:		Hispanic/Latino/Spanish
Currently in a Relationship:				
	.cupation:	Ket	Ired	Unemployed Current/Former Military
Injury and Death Information Injury Date: / Inj	ury Address:			Manner of Death:
Injured at own home Injured v	vhile in custody 🗌 🛛 E	MS at scene	Alcoh	ol use suspected when injured
Autopsy Information Height (in inches): Weight	(in pounds):	If Female, Preg	nancy S	Status:
Number of Penetrating Wounds i.e. Number of bullets that hit victim:		ry counts as 1 wound	; bullet e	xit counts as another): Note: one shotgun blast = 1 wound
Penetrating Wound Locations (chec		lead 🗌 🦳 Face 🗌		
Circumstances – Complete the fo Mental Health and Substance Abuse		INERS OF DEATH	<u>I</u>	NOTE: each circumstance checked should be explained in the narrative (see pg.4)
Current depressed mood	Current ment	al health		Other substance problem/abuse
Current mental health diagnosis(es)		for mental health		Other addiction
Please List:	Alcohol probl	abuse problem em		Please List:
Relationship Problems / Exposure to	o Violence			
Intimate partner violence	Family relationship p	problem 🔲	Abuse	or neglect led to death
Intimate partner problem	Other relationship p	roblem 🗌	History	y of abuse or neglect as a child
Physical fight (2 people)	Previous perpetrator violence in the past			
Argument Timing of Argument:	Previous victim of vi in the past month	olence		
Crime and Criminal Activity				
Precipitated by another crime Crime(s) Type:	Prostitution or sex trafficking	Gan	g Relate	d 🗆
First crime in progress	Stalking	Wal	k-by ass	ault
Circumstances – Complete the fo	llowing for <u>HOMICIE</u>	DE & LEGAL INTE	RVENT	<u>TON</u> Deaths only
Justifiable self defense	Mercy killing			Victim was an intervener
Victim was a police officer on duty	Hate crime			Victim used a weapon

Jealousy (lover's triangle)

Brawl (3 people or more in a physical fight)

Drive-by shooting

Drug involvement

Victim was a bystander

Random violence

Circumstances – Complete the following for **SUICIDE & UNDETERMINED** Deaths only

History of suicide attempts		History of expressed suicidal thoughts or plans		Contributing physical health problem	
Disclosed suicidal thoughts or intent	1	Contributing criminal legal	1	Job problem	
to commit suicide		problem		Financial problem	
To whom:		Civil legal problems		School problem	
Left a suicide note		Anniversary of a traumatic event		Eviction or loss of home	
Disaster exposure		Suicide of friend or family		Non-suicide death of friend/family	

Circumstances – Complete the following for UNINTENTIONAL/ACCIDENTAL FIREARM DEATHS only:

		_	Gun defect or malfunction	
Self-defensive shooting	Loading or unloading gun		Thought gun was unloaded	
Target Shooting	Cleaning Gun		Unintentionally pulled trigger	
Thought safety was engaged	Showing gun to others		Other mechanism of injury	

Weapon Information

Primary Weapon Description (e.g. Knife, gun, hanging/rope, blunt instrument, poison, hands/fist)______

for any death involving a <i>firearm</i> , enter the following:						
Number of non-fatally sh	not persons: Gun Ov	vner/Relationship to victim:				
Gun stored loaded 🗌	Gun stored locked 🗌	Gun reported stolen 🗖				

Suspect (or "S") Information (list in order of primacy; applicable only if NOT self-inflicted) or Suspect Info Unknown

S Number	Age (years)	Gender	Race	Hispanic	History of abuse of victim by this S	S was caregiver for the victim	S attempted suicide	S mentally ill	Suspect-Victim Relationship
1									
2									
3									

*Please list any additional suspects and suspect information on the back of this form

Brief Narrative of the Incident

or 🗌 See Attached